

Let $V = \{(x, y) : x, y \in \mathbb{R}\}$ have the operations

$$(x_1, x_2) \oplus (y_1, y_2) = (x_1 y_1, x_2 + y_2)$$

$$c \odot (x_1, x_2) = (x_1 + c - 1, c x_2)$$

a) Show that vector addition is associative:

$$(\vec{u} \oplus \vec{v}) \oplus \vec{w} = \vec{u} \oplus (\vec{v} \oplus \vec{w}) \text{ for all } \vec{u}, \vec{v}, \vec{w} \in V.$$

b) Explain why V nonetheless is NOT a vector space.

$$a) \text{ LHS} = (\vec{u} \oplus \vec{v}) \oplus \vec{w} = ((u_1, u_2) \oplus (v_1, v_2)) \oplus \vec{w}$$

$$= (u_1, v_1, u_2 + v_2) \oplus (w_1, w_2)$$

$$= (u_1, v_1, w_1, u_2 + v_2 + w_2)$$

$$\text{RHS} = \vec{u} \oplus (\vec{v} \oplus \vec{w}) = \vec{u} \oplus ((v_1, v_2) \oplus (w_1, w_2))$$

$$= (u_1, u_2) \oplus (v_1 + w_1, v_2 + w_2)$$

$$= (u_1, v_1, w_1, u_2 + v_2 + w_2)$$

So LHS = RHS, proving the identity true.

$$b) \cancel{1 \circ (2, 3) = (2+1-1, 1 \cdot 3) = (2, 3)}$$

(↑ Gotta try something else, this seems fine.)

$$b) (1+2) \circ (3, 4) = 3 \circ (3, 4)$$

$$= (3+3-1, 3 \cdot 4)$$

$$= (5, 12)$$

but

$$1 \circ (3, 4) \oplus 2 \circ (3, 4) = (3+1-1, 1 \cdot 4) \oplus (3+2-1, 2 \cdot 4)$$

$$= (3, 4) \oplus (4, 8)$$

$$= (3 \cdot 4, 4+8)$$

$$= (12, 12) \neq (5, 12)$$

Since the distributive property fails, V is not a vector space.

OR

$$b) (2 \cdot 2) \circ (0, 0) = 4 \circ (0, 0) = (0+4-1, 4 \cdot 0) = (3, 0)$$

but

$$2 \circ (2 \circ (0, 0)) = 2 \circ (0+2-1, 2 \cdot 0) = 2 \circ (1, 0)$$

$$= (1+2-1, 2 \cdot 0) = (2, 0) \neq (3, 0)$$

Since the associative property fails, V is not a vector space.